

J. Campbell But you've got an accented A in the variations haven't you, in Scarce of Fishing?

A. Kenneth Yes that's true.

J. Campbell And in the first note of all the variations there's a low A.

A. Kenneth Yes very true.

P. Cooke Yes well but I was asked about the ground.

A. Kenneth Yes it's a ground note if it's echoed in the variations. Can it still be anacrusis? It's a melody note in this . . .

P. Cooke I think in certain variations then it changes its role, the note changes its role.

A. Kenneth Yes well we can forget that bit of it but I would say that technical investigation on various types of cadence has taken place with interesting results and will probably be taken much further. I thought that anacrusis in the strict sense is fairly limited but I don't see Scarce of Fishing and the Glen is Mine as being good examples of anacrusis for the reason that the A is duplicated in the variations.

Chairman Do you think the knowledge of the term helps in the teaching and learning of piobaireachd?

A. Kenneth Not in the least, no.

Chairman What do you think James.

J. Campbell Not in the least.

Chairman John?

J. Burgess I agree.

Chairman 99.9%?

J. Burgess 100%.

---

Chairman Right we can pass on. I think we'll have our last question. And this one is I suppose of some importance. It's a small technical one, number 6 on your sheet Archie which I'll come back to you immediately with. "The senior piobaireachd at Oban in 1986 was won by a performance in which the D taorluath and crunluath movements were played with a D gracenote instead of a B. This is being quoted in North America as justification for playing the D instead of the B gracenote in these embellishments. Does the panel consider that the two ways are equally acceptable?" Archie.

A. Kenneth Well I might accept it, but I would not teach it. I regard it as a condonable imperfection if the tune is clearly the best. I would hate to debar a tune for that reason completely if it was clearly and

outstandingly the best.

Chairman But you don't think it's as correct as doing it with the B?

A. Kenneth I think it's more correct to do it with the B. That's the way I got it.

Chairman James what do you think?

J. Campbell It's certainly more orthodox to do it with a B and I would, having been brought up to play it with a B, I would say it was more correct.

I've never myself been able to understand why it should be incorrect to play a D gracenote. I mean there are some people who might have what I think Malcolm called this morning, a hang-up over the B gracenote. As an alternative to playing the D gracenote this way they might pack in competing altogether, and I'd have a lot of sympathy for the person in that situation who came up and played a D gracenote.

Chairman John?

J. Burgess Well we were told last night about all the pipers coming across here from North America and other parts, and if this is the done thing over there and they come over playing D gracenotes in D taorluaths, God help them if they appear in front of me!

Anyway I believe that the Royal Scottish Pipe Band Association in their Tutor give as the correct way the D gracenote in the taorluath from D, and they give the B gracenote as an alternative way of playing it. But ach well, you know the pipe band players.

Dr David Hannay There is in fact a reason why a B gracenote is difficult. If you look at the extensor tendons on your hand, the little finger - the pinkie - and the B gracenote finger, the extensor tendons there are often linked and if you try and raise your B finger alone it can actually be quite difficult. It's easy to raise both of them but it is not easy to raise, for many people, one of them.

Chairman There is a difference in writing that I notice.

I haven't really investigated enough but in the older books which show a redundant low A they don't show the redundant low A on the D taorluath or crunluath. This seems to me to imply that there was a different sound entirely intended there - although I may be guilty of misreading the writings of the manuscripts and not sticking to my traditional teaching.

Frans Buisman This is in Angus MacKay only.

Chairman Is it Angus MacKay only that does it? It's great to have an expert in the place. Well done Frans.

J. Burgess I would agree with Archie. It would be possible I have no doubt that someone might play a piobaireachd and go through it with the taorluath and crunluath variations with a D gracenote. Depending on

the quality of the competition, the man might still have played the best tune.

Chairman Yes. At the Ardvassar Seminar last year, or maybe it was the year before, we debated this at some length and we finished up with the conclusion that this was a flaw to be considered against other flaws in performances.

J. MacLellan In all the writings and manuscripts there is no evidence of a D gracenote being played on a D taorluath. In every one that I've come across it's a B gracenote - that is until the Scottish Pipe Band Tutor and Textbook came out.

Chairman Donald MacLeod of course used to play the D gracenote. He claimed he played the B one when he was facing the judge and the D one when he had his back to him because he found it much easier to do the D but I'm not sure whether that really happened or not.

Kenneth MacLean I think if you are playing the movement with the B gracenote it makes a more plaintive sound. You get a much better sound as in the likes of MacIntosh's Lament - you get a softer sound with the B gracenote rather than the D.

R. Beck I think Kenneth has just answered me. I was going to ask can you hear any difference? If you can't hear any difference and if you can't give me a good reason then I really think back to all these years of hours and hours and hours trying to make a damned B.

A. Kenneth You think you were wasting your time perhaps? I don't think so. Good for the soul.

B. Campbell I got involved in a controversy in Australia once and it came before the judges' panel out there. I brought up evidence which everybody seemed to have missed. It's a printed source - Willie Gray's Tutor which I think came out in the 20's or 30's. He emphasized the playing from the D was more acceptable with a B gracenote. However he wrote down two alternatives - one with a D gracenote and one with a C gracenote which he felt were equally acceptable although he stressed that the B was more accepted by the general public.

Chairman Well I think there we have to leave it. Ladies and gentlemen I have to thank you for your attendance, and my panellists here for their excellent contributions.